

MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING

OF THE

BOARD OF VISITORS

UNITED STATES AIR FORCE ACADEMY

7 December 2012

APPROVED:

by the USAFA BOARD OF VISITORS

15 March 2013

INDEX

TOPIC **PAGE**

December 7, 2012

Attendance.....3
Opening Comments & Presentation of Distinguished Public Service Award4

BRIEFINGS

Superintendent’s Update.....4
Character Update5
Remarks from Honorable Michael Donley & Gen Mark Welsh III.....6
Development of a USAFA Second Lieutenant.....6
Subcommittee Out-Briefs.....7
USAFA Admissions Brief.....8

**MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING
BOARD OF VISITORS (BoV)**

UNITED STATES AIR FORCE ACADEMY (USAFA)

The Chair opened the December USAFA Board of Visitors meeting on December 7, 2012. The meeting was held at the Senate Visitors Center in Washington, DC.

ATTENDANCE

MEMBERS PRESENT:

Mr. Alfredo Sandoval (Chair)
Lt General (Ret) Arlen "Dirk" Jameson (Vice Chair)
Representative Jared Polis (D-CO) via Telecon
Representative Niki Tsongas (D-MA)
Mr. Robin Hayes
Dr. Thomas McKiernan
Mr. Fletcher "Flash" Wiley

MEMBERS ABSENT:

Senator Michael Bennet (D-CO)
Senator Lindsey Graham (R- SC)
Senator John Hoeven (R- ND)
Senator Ben Nelson (D-NE)
Representative Loretta Sanchez (D-CA)
Representative Doug Lamborn (R-CO)
Major General (Ret) Marcelite Harris (participated in subcommittees Dec 6)

AIR FORCE SENIOR STAFF:

Honorable Michael Donley, SAF/OS
Gen Mark Welsh III, AF/CC
Honorable Daniel Ginsberg, SAF/MR
Lt Gen Darrell Jones, AF/A1
Mr. Bill Booth, SES, SAF/MRR -- USAFA BoV Designated Federal Official (DFO)

USAFA SENIOR STAFF:

Lt Gen Michael Gould, Superintendent
Brig Gen Greg Lengyel, Commandant of Cadets
Brig Gen Dana Born, Dean of the Faculty
Dr. Hans Mueh, Director of Athletics
Dr. Adis Vila, Chief Diversity Officer
Col Rich Fogg, Vice Commander, 10th Air Base Wing
Col Kim Hawthorne, Director of Plans, Policies and Assessments
Col Carolyn Benyshek, Director of Admissions
Col Scott Dierlam, United States Air Force Academy Liaison

Mr. Dave Cannon, Director of Strategic Communications
CMSgt Steve Ludwig, USAFA Command Chief

BoV EXECUTIVE SECRETARY:
Lt Col Tammy Trychon (AF/AIPT)

OPENING COMMENTS

The Board convened and the Chairman, Mr. Alfredo Sandoval, called the meeting to order at 9:34 a.m. The DFO was present and enough members were in attendance to establish a quorum. Mr. Sandoval announced the presentation of the Distinguished Public Service Award to Ambassador Susan Schwab. Secretary Donley thanked Ambassador Schwab for her outstanding leadership the past three years. Next, Gen Gould and Chief Ludwig presented Ambassador Schwab with the USAFA falcon statue and again thanked her for her dedication to the Academy. Ambassador Schwab stated that it had been an honor to be associated with the Air Force Academy and shared her best wishes for the future.

Mr. Sandoval commented that, due to a requirement in the Bylaws, the Board needed to reconfirm the Board of Visitors vote for officers that occurred 15 September 2012. Mr. Sandoval called for a vote and the Board members unanimously confirmed Mr. Sandoval as Chair and Lt Gen (ret) Jameson as Vice Chair of the USAFA Board of Visitors.

Mr. Sandoval reminded the Board of the subcommittee rationale, and explained that during the next few meetings each subcommittee(s) needed to develop a charter to ensure issues are relevant and applicable to USAFA.

SUPERINTENDENT'S UPDATE

Mr. Sandoval invited Lt Gen Gould to begin the Superintendent's update and he thanked the Secretary and Chief for their participation in the meeting.

Lt Gen Gould commented that USAFA overcame challenges this year, specifically a few cadet losses and legal cases. He updated the Board on cadet legal cases and then moved into the areas of excellence for the Academy. In particular, Lt Gen Gould told the Board that cadets approached Brig Gen Lengyel to put on a 9-11 remembrance and wreath laying ceremony. He explained that the service took place at USAFA's 9/11 Memorial. Additionally, Lt Gen Gould shared that the cadets participated in a 45 mile relay across Colorado Springs to commemorate the POW-MIA remembrance. He touched on the Cadet for a Day program and the 10th Air Base Wing's firefighters who won the world championships in firefighting and continue to support the Waldo Canyon cleanup efforts.

Next, Lt Gen Gould said that the Academy broke ground on the new Center for Character and Leadership Development. He shared a video presentation and explained that major construction would begin in January. Additionally, Lt Gen Gould encouraged the Board to visit the Falcon Heritage Center during the next meeting at the Academy.

Lt Gen Gould discussed the excellence cadets demonstrated through club activities (e.g., triathlon team, men's volleyball, rodeo club, cycling team, mock trial team, cyber competition team, etc.) He shared a few other highlights including: International Week, the Forensics Tournament hosted by the Academy, and the ACES dinner at the Dean's house. Lt Gen Gould explained that the Academy recently learned they had both a Marshall Scholar and a Holaday Scholarship winner.

Lt Gen Gould touched on the precision flying team and shared that he expects great things from the sailplane flying team this year. He commented that ESPN Sports Nation had visited the Academy and Lt Gen Gould shared a video from their time at USAFA. Next, Lt Gen Gould provided details from the second biannual religious respect conference hosted by Father Bob Bruno. He explained that the conference drew a large crowd with nearly every faith group represented. Lt Gen Gould commented that reps from other MAJCOMs attended.

Finally, Lt Gen Gould asked if the Board had any questions and Lt Gen (ret) Jameson commented that as the son of a long-time Air Force chaplain, he's followed the religious training program closely and said that he felt it was a stellar program. Mr. Wiley asked if there were any similarities in the backgrounds of cadets who were having problems that could potentially be identified and addressed in the admissions process. Lt Gen Gould explained that unfortunately the threads between cases aren't there.

Congresswoman Tsongas thanked Lt Gen Gould for the briefing and mentioned that last year's defense authorization bill discussed sexual assault and provided tools to prevent such incidents in the future. She requested that in an upcoming meeting, the Academy provide the Board with an update on how the Academy plans to deal with some of these requirements that have been made law. Lt Gen Gould responded that he would prepare a briefing for the next BoV meeting.

Mr. Sandoval thanked Lt Gen Gould and asked the Board to please review the September Board of Visitors minutes so that they could take a vote and approve the minutes. Lt Gen (ret) Jameson shared that he had a few edits and Mr. Wiley moved that the minutes be approved subject to the corrections by Lt Gen (ret) Jameson. Mr. Hayes seconded the motion and the Board approved the September minutes.

(The open session recessed at 10:27 a.m.)

CHARACTER UPDATE BRIEF (CLOSED SESSION)

Brig Gen Lengyel provided an update on cadet disciplinary issues during this closed session.

(The closed session ended and the open session reconvened at 11:22 a.m.)

REMARKS FROM HONORABLE MICHAEL DONLEY & GENERAL MARK WELSH

Secretary Donley thanked the Board for their support of the Academy and shared his appreciation for the inputs and discussion each member of the Board has provided. He

announced two additional Board members that will replace Ambassador Schwab and Mr. Robin Hayes. Secretary Donley shared that Sue Hoppin, President of the National Military Spouse Network and Dr. Paula Thornhill, retired Brig Gen from the RAND Corporation would join the Board. He mentioned that the search process for Brig Gen Born's replacement is underway and that a board was organized to screen applications and make a list of recommended qualified candidates for leadership's review.

Mr. Wiley shared that he and Dr. McKiernan had discussed the importance of having an in-service Dean of Faculty at the Academy and explained that having a military member in that role shows cadets the kind of officers that the Academy is trying to produce. Secretary Donley agreed and stated that Brig Gen Born is an outstanding academic and commander and that is what cadets need to see.

Next, Gen Welsh stated how impressed he was with the Board's bios and service they've given to the nation and shared his thoughts on the Academy. He said that the Academy is all about people and that USAFA has the opportunity to focus on producing the highest quality officers. He mentioned that the Air Force is in the process of executing a health and welfare inspection. Gen Welsh mentioned the topic of diversity Air Force-wide and shared that we need to be more nuanced in our interpretation of diversity. He commented that perhaps a diversity summit could help to figure out where we are and where we want to go with Air Force diversity.

Gen Welsh mentioned that during a discussion recently with a group of female officers, he asked them about retention rates noting that woman officers separate at a 50% higher rate than men with 8-14 years of service. Gen Welsh explained that he asked the officers if it was due to a glass ceiling. The officers responded that it is due to social and family challenges rather than simply a glass ceiling.

Finally, Gen Welsh mentioned that he and Lt Gen Gould discussed putting together a broad view of the Academy with the mentality of starting the Academy today. He explained that the intent is to have a fresh look and new perspective to further improve the Academy. Gen Welsh shared some final comments and expressed his appreciation to the Academy faculty and leadership for developing these cadets.

Mr. Sandoval thanked the Secretary and Chief and announced that the Board would take a five minute break. Congressman Polis departed the teleconference.

(Recess from 1:39 p.m. to 1:45 p.m.)

DEVELOPMENT OF A USAFA SECOND LIEUTENANT

Lt Gen Gould began his presentation on the development of a second lieutenant by sharing the mission of USAFA to develop leaders of character. Lt Gen Gould shared that the Constitution, Oath of Office, AF Core Values, and AF Officership are the foundation of military service. He said the purpose of Service Academies is to provide career-motivated officers that are immersed in traditions and professional values. Lt Gen Gould shared that the Service Academy develops officers that achieve a 4-year college education, convey traditions and values, and sustain a

professional attitude essential to the long-term readiness of the Armed Forces. Lt Gen Gould explained that the Academy is overseen by SAF/MR and AF/A1; all in an effort to ensure Academy policy compliments Air Force policy. Additionally, Lt Gen Gould commented that additional oversight comes from the General Officer Steering Committee and the Executive Steering Group which is chaired by the Vice Chief of Staff.

Lt Gen Gould explained the various competencies and sub-competencies that USAFA is attempting to develop in cadets and commented that the competencies are outlined in the AF Institutional Competency List (AFDD 1-1). Specifically, Lt Gen Gould touched on the development of a second lieutenant and shared that the system used is called the Officer Development System. He stated that the program is designed to achieve key objectives across all mission elements. In particular, Gen Gould shared that the Academy works to develop each cadet as an individual starting with the fourth degree. He explained that the opportunity to develop and acculturate cadets at the personal level begins as soon as these individuals arrive at the Academy. Lt Gen Gould said that in a cadet's three-degree year the Academy starts working on interpersonal skills and the two-degree and first year is spent applying the interpersonal and personal development into a team setting. He commented that the end goal is to ensure each cadet becomes an organizational leader. He shared that after providing cadets with an intensive experience across 4 years, the Academy reviews the key measures to ensure each cadet developed the desired outcomes.

Gen Gould wrapped up the brief by outlining areas where the Board may help USAFA including: continue to champion for USAFA, advocate during funding challenges, discuss the Academy's relevance, be a spokesman for USAFA diversity when engaging with Congress, provide inputs on how the Academy can continue to evolve, and seek ground-truth on any notable, breaking news event.

Chairman Sandoval stated that he really enjoyed the brief and encouraged Lt Gen Gould to continue to use the Board however needed.

SUB-COMMITTEE OUTBRIEFS

Chairman Sandoval stated that the Board would first hear from Dr. McKiernan and the Academic subcommittee. Dr. McKiernan presented their subcommittee charter for approval and the Board voted unanimously to pass the Academic charter. Chairman Sandoval said that the Academic charter could be used as a template for the other subcommittees as they move through and develop their own charters.

Next, Mr. Wiley provided the Diversity subcommittee outbrief. He said that Brig Gen Lengyel spoke to the subcommittee about the definition of diversity, workplace inclusion, and sustainability.

Mr. Wiley stated that the athletic department and the admissions office recruit separately and suggested that in the future the Board looks for ways to be more helpful to them. He said that the subcommittee discussed the fact that the Air Force Academy brand needs bolstering, specifically in minority communities. Mr. Wiley mentioned the issue of congressional members not having

individuals from their districts represented at the Academy. He noted that the subcommittee discussed ways to work more efficiently with congressional offices.

Dr. McKiernan provided a few more comments from the Academics subcommittee on performance measure for academics and student health services and commented both were on track. He noted that the subcommittee believes the Board should pay special attention to the transition from Brig Gen Born's leadership to the new Dean.

Next, Mr. Sandoval asked Col Fogg to provide the Board with a brief overview from the Infrastructure subcommittee meeting. Col Fogg began by thanking the Board for their support of the Fix USAFA resources and infrastructure which he explained is linked to the Fix USAFA program. He shared that in fiscal year '13 USAFA will complete Vandenberg phase 9, Mitchell Hall phase 8, Cadet Gym phase 4 and 5, etc. Col Fogg commented that although there is a perception that USAFA has new facilities, most buildings are from the 1950s and 1960s. He encouraged the Board to continue to support the Fix USAFA campaign so that the Academy may continue to make the needed infrastructure updates.

Chairman Sandoval stated that one of his goals as Chair is for all Board members to be aware of USAFA funding needs and encourage participation by our congressional Board members. Mr. Wiley commented that he would be interested in how the Academy compares to other academic institutions of similar size in terms of the overall cost to run them. Chairman Sandoval responded that it was a great idea and then began to brief the Board on the Strategic Planning Subcommittee. He shared that the subcommittee asked Lt Gen Gould for his perspective on the continuing challenges at the Academy and encouraged Brig Gen Born to contribute her insights too. Mr. Wiley clarified that Lt Gen Gould will be providing the Board with candid feedback on how the Board can be more productive and further support the Academy.

USAFA ADMISSIONS BRIEF

Chairman Sandoval shared background on the admissions briefing and invited Col Benyshek to begin her presentation.

Col Benyshek stated that because Title 10 governs USAFA, admissions must follow a specific framework that regulates how and what the Academy does. Specifically, the admissions department receives, processes, reviews, and evaluates *every* applicant that comes through the process. She explained that students must first receive either a congressional or military nomination and then the Academy Board, chaired by Lt Gen Gould, approves the appointment into USAFA. Col Benyshek stated that USAFA encourages potential cadets to apply for all nominating categories of eligibility. She explained that the Academy makes determinations of qualified candidates based on their ability to meet USAFA requirements. Col Benyshek said for a congressional nomination every student competes with all the other students within a nominating category. She shared that every congressional member, by law, has five available charges at the Academy at any one time. She clarified that for each vacant charge a member of congress may nominate up to ten students.

Mr. Hayes asked if cadets must fill vacancies from their congressional districts and Col

Benyshek responded that congressionally nominated cadets must fill the charge from their particular congressional district.

Congresswoman Tsongas shared that you don't have to fill all five of the congressional charges if the nominee doesn't meet USAFA admissions requirements. Col Benyshek agreed and reiterated that the candidates must be qualified; however a congressional member may wish to designate a principal nominee. She explained that if the principal nominee is qualified to attend the Academy based on meeting key requirements, USAFA must accept the nominee.

Col Benyshek provided background on the congressional nominations; specifically sharing that when congressional nominations were initiated, these nominations were considered a noncompetitive category. She noted that congressional offices with great kids at the Academy have an active nominating program with their own processes and vet the quality of candidates themselves.

Mr. Ginsberg commented that the number of nominations is moving in a positive direction with more congressional members engaging and nominating more qualified students. Mr. Sandoval pointed out that USAFA has worked on improving the congressional nominations for the last 2-3 years and noted that Col Benyshek has done a great job.

Next, Col Benyshek discussed the military-related nominations. She noted not many Medal of Honor or children of deceased and disabled MIA are being nominated currently. Col Benyshek explained that students who are eligible for a presidential nomination typically are children of active duty members, retirees, or those of Guard and Reserve who served at least eight consecutive years.

Lt Gen (ret) Jameson asked where that guidance comes from and Col Benyshek responded that the standards are from Title 10. She pointed out that USAFA may only appoint up to 100 students from the presidential nomination category by law. Col Benyshek shared that this past year USAFA only appointed 20 presidential nominees based on the congressional must-fills and class size.

Lt Gen (ret) Jameson asked if the Superintendent's 50 nominations come predominately from the Academy Prep School. Col Benyshek replied that the admissions office typically provides Lt Gen Gould with the viable candidates who may have missed deadlines to apply for other types of nominations (i.e. regular nominations, congressional nominations, etc.) She pointed out that typically only 30 of the Superintendent's 50 nominations are used.

Mr. Ginsberg asked if the more recent trend is a spike upwards due to the economy and Col Benyshek commented that admissions numbers are actually trending downward. She explained that the Academy received approximately 12,000 applicants last year; however there were many summer seminar students this year who decided that USAFA was not for them and never fully applied. Col Benyshek indicated that the student's information was still included in the application process and therefore they were counted into the 12,000 applicants.

Col Benyshek shared that the Academy can only select students who meet the Academy

qualifications. She noted that the recruitment team is focused on increasing the number of qualified candidates so that the admissions office has a large pool of qualified candidates to select from.

Congresswoman Tsongas asked if the 12,000 applicants were qualified candidates and Col Benyshek responded in the affirmative. She shared that disqualifying factors may be fitness, medical, grades, or issues from adolescence that make them no longer competitive in the process. Lt Gen (ret) Jameson noted that if students are qualified they have about a one in three chance of being selected for the Academy.

Col Benyshek reiterated that the Academy could not be happier with the quality of students that are going through the application process. Lt Gen (ret) Jameson asked about the process for international students and Col Benyshek explained that the admissions process is completely separate and international students are not counted in the 12,000 number.

Next, Col Benyshek discussed some of the admissions challenges including the fact that race and ethnicity are self reported and the potential of misrepresenting oneself. She said that funding sources are a challenge, yet the admissions office is doing what they can with the funding available.

Col Benyshek told the Board about a consortium of retired Generals who conducted a study that looked into the number of students across America who are eligible to serve in the military. She reported that only 25% of 17-24 year-olds meet the eligibility standards to serve in the military. This is primarily due to three factors: failure to graduate from high school, fitness standards (obesity), and/or a criminal record.

Chairman Sandoval asked if the percentage of eligible individuals is higher in specific communities or is it consistent across demographics. Lt Gen Jones said that it's consistent across the board although he could not provide exact numbers. Col Benyshek mentioned that she's asked her team to look hard at the strategic cities for recruitment and continues to speak with congressional offices with less than 3 cadets from their district represented at the Academy.

Next, Col Benyshek asked for the Board's help in targeting community-based organizations and Mr. Ginsberg asked if the Air Liaison Officers (ALOs) are involved in identifying organizations. Col Benyshek responded that it's not part of the ALO mission, however the Academy is trying to organize alumni willing to assist with outreach and recruitment efforts as well as tying in with community-based organizations. Mr. Sandoval suggested that the recruiting team leverage community colleges as an avenue for recruitment and Col Benyshek acknowledged that a process is in the works. Mr. Wiley commented that the Academy could create an institutional mechanism to alert the Black and Hispanic Caucus' of the opportunity young men and woman have to join the Academy. Congresswoman Tsongas reiterated that providing congressional members with best practices for nominating students for the Academy would be beneficial.

Finally, Col Benyshek commented that the congressional districts with the most nominations have an individual dedicated to service academy nominations. She noted that ideally students are aware of the opportunity to be a part of the Academy in elementary school and proposed that

ALO's start to present to students at career fairs to increase the outreach.

Chairman Sandoval thanked Col Benyshek and reminded the Board that the next meeting will be March 15th and 16th at the Academy.

(The proceedings were adjourned at 1:00 p.m.)


TAMMY M. TRYCHON, Lt Col, USAF
Executive Secretary


ALFREDO A. SANDOVAL
Chair, USAFA Board of Visitors